The Use of Substitution Tables in Controlled and Guided Composition Writing

Jalina bt Abdullah

When the pupil is given the task of writing a composition, and that too in a foreign language like English, he is in fact burdened with more than one task. He not only has to think of what to say but how to say what he wants to say in a way relevant to the situation in which the language is used. "How to say what he wants to say" involves a good stock of vocabulary, a sound knowledge of grammar and an ability to link his ideas in a logical order. For a learner of English as a Second Language, this is indeed a big task especially as we do not want to nurture a negative attitude towards the writing of compositions. I remember how we moaned and groaned over the idea of having to produce, without any teacher guidance, a lengthy essay. When it was all done it was like having scaled Mt. Everest but when we got back our books many of us felt the reverse — a death plunge to the foothills. We do not want history to repeat itself and to find our students completely demotivated by an abundance of red marks and low scores.

Our role as a teacher is to guide our students. As an English teacher you will agree with me that writing compositions is a much dreaded activity in the classroom. We have to show pupils that writing a composition can be done with little difficulty and that success is within the reach of every pupil. A teacher can help pupils achieve success and a sense of accomplishment by embarking on a course of guided writing by first using linked substitution tables and then progressing, in stages, to a completely free writing stage.

A completely controlled approach is a good start especially with pupils who have no control over their English language structures, transforms, functional words, idioms etc. It also permits sufficient time for the learners to develop skills within these areas. The substitution table is indeed an efficient teaching tool. Several substitution tables linked together by sentences arranged in a logical order and in paragraphs offer the pupil the chance to write many alternative compositions based on the same topic. In such completely controlled linked substituition tables, there is a complete avoidance of error. At the same time the pupils are being exposed to grammatically correct sentences which, hopefully, will serve as models for later writing.

Once the pupils have been given sufficient practice at this stage of controlled writing, the teacher may embark on the almost controlled linked substitution table exercises progressing gradually to the substantially guided linked substitution tables and those that give little or some guidance. In these three types of substitution tables, a more advanced selection of alternatives is required of pupils who have either to make lexical, grammatical or stylistic choices. This entails the students to think in order to make an acceptable choice of the language alternatives offered. Such exercises cannot be branded as "mechanical and dull".

One other aspect of training provided by such exercises is the practice in a correct style or register such as required in a narrative, descriptive or argumentative piece of writing or in letters or in technical writing.

Below are examples of the 4 types of controlled and guided linked substitution tables mentioned earlier.

Composition 1 — Completely controlled linked substitution tables

Composition 2 - Almost controlled linked substitution tables

Composition 3 – Substantially guided linked substitution tables

Composition 4 - Some guidance and a little guidance linked substitution tables.

1. Completely Controlled Linked Substitution Type

To The Market

Language Items:

Simple Present Tense, Adjectives of quantity and quality,

Indefinite Numbers and quantities

Teaching Aid:

Use a picture of a market scene as a stimulus

Every	Sunday Saturday Monday my house. I see			l walk cycle take a bus			to the market. It is			
not far from near 1 mile from			all kinds of many a lot of			people on the way. Sometimes				
I meet my	good friends teachers neighbours		at	at the market. I usu		usually	say hello to greet smile at	them.		
They come to buy fish fruit vegetal empty basket to carry take		fruit				eggs. They also cakes. flowers.		bring along an		
		hon	home what they buy. Som			ne of them buy	a lot of only a few a large number of			
things. The market is a			busy place in the morning, noisy crowded				e morning, but in	n the evening		

it is	quiet.
	peaceful.
	deserted.

2. Almost Controlled Linked Substitution Type

A Malaysian Fruit

Language Items:

Adjectives of quality, the Passive

Teaching Aids:

Pictures of 3 types of Malaysian fruit — durians, mangosteens

and rambutans

The	durian mangosteen rambutan	is a	sma med larg	dium size	fruit with a		hairy thorny smooth	
skin. It is		or yellow yellow ourple	in colour. When it ripens, it					
falls is plucked		tree which	n is	not very l				
a strong no	smell. Wh	nen it is op	ened, yo	ou can see		several seeds only one seed		
inside.	Each The	seed is co	overed w	vith a layer o	f	firm white flesh soft creamy soft, snow-white		
During the durian rambutan mangosteen				season, many fruit stalls are set up beside th				de the
road. The fruit is neatly Most Malaysians like the			tied up in bundles piled up in small heaps			to attract buyers.		
			durian rambutan mangosteen			because of its taste.		

3. Substantially Controlled Linked Substitution Type

A Dialogue

Language Items:

Negative questions with prepositions,

Relative "that" and "which"

Choose for A:

A suitable price, in Malaysian dollars, for the article you are

writing about.

B: A price 20% less than (A) for the same article.

C: A final price 10% less than (A) for the same article.

A	Is Isn't	this th	e	guit shir pen frod	rt	tha	nt you	as w	vanted to buy? sked for? vere telling me about ave tried on? ave chosen?		
в	Not		ictly.	I wante	d someth	ning	like		Ahmad	Ahmad's.	
	No.	qui	uite.		the same exactly				the one	l you	
	showe	d you th	is morn							my	
	father friend		has. bought								
A	Which Which What		do y	s that? ou mean like?	?						
В	It's the	e one	with		red ar a gold	e strin nd bla d ribbo k prin	ck stripes on.				
			whic	ch has			bottom. ure on it.				
А	Oh!		at's	very	er expen expension for sale.						
В	What a	nuch is it a pity! I	t? like tha	t very mu							
Α	(A)										
	Sorry,		Not	my son's. right nov vill have a	v. Maybe	, by S	Saturday,	the ne	w stock	_	
В	(A) All rig			h. Can't y ne by on							
	lt's all	right.		Oo you m Maybe yo		ne	hav	e a clo	ser look at	it?	
Α	Very well,		l'II let ' You ma			hav	e it for th	ne fina	I price of (C)	
	Don't			mber to	keep one	aside	for you.				
	Certai	means. nly. vhy not?									
В	l'll tal Thank Goody	you ver	y much	ı .							

4. Some Guidance and a Little Guidance Linked Substitution Type

A Cleaning Up Project

Language Item:

Sentence Connectors

Read over the exercise below carefully. Notice each blank space is marked with a ?. This indicates that a word is needed and you are to provide the word. Where there are no ?'s in the frames, just choose the appropriate word/words given. Notice the Title is incomplete too. Supply an appropriate word at the end.

The place where I live in is in need of a big housing area kampong
clean up. First, the roads paths must be attended to. They are
strewn with all kinds of rubbish which has to be ?.
Secondly, the drains require sweeping as they are the water improving in them
Thirdly, the children's playground which is overgrown strewn ? whenever it rains
with grass has to be looked into. The swings and slides need a new stones
coat of ? paint ot make them look prettier. more attractive. ?
Many children love playing there in the evenings. Finally, those ? like
residents who keep fowls in their back-yards should be requested told?
keep the chicken coops clean in order to cut down the ?. Hopefully, when
all these improvements are done, my ? will be a cleaner good ?